

# **Appendix I**

## **Case-Studies in Wilderness Management**

# Management Issue Scenarios

**Note:** These scenarios are meant to be used as guidelines for the program leader rather than to be read verbatim.

Introduce a management issue. Divide the class into groups and have each group take one viewpoint in a discussion of the issue. Encourage solutions that utilize a variety of management options (eg regulations, education, control of use levels, personal impact reduction, signs, structures, etc).

## Wilderness Key Points

Each group should receive these key points.

1. Wilderness areas “shall be administered for the use and enjoyment of the American people in such a manner as will leave them unimpaired for future use and enjoyment as wilderness.”
2. “A wilderness...is hereby recognized as an area where the earth and its community of life are untrammelled by man, where man himself is a visitor who does not remain.”
3. “An area of wilderness is...undeveloped Federal land retaining its primitive character and influence, without permanent improvements or human habitation.”
4. Wilderness “generally appears to have been affected primarily by the force of nature, with the imprint of man’s work substantially unnoticeable.”
5. Wilderness “has outstanding opportunities for solitude or primitive and unconfined type of recreation.”
6. “Except as necessary to meet minimum requirements for the administration of the are...there shall be no temporary road, no use of motor vehicles, motorized equipments or motorboats, no landing of aircraft, no other form of mechanical transport, and no structure or installation within any such area.”

## Solitude / Demand

Part of the definition of wilderness, according to the Wilderness Act, is that it “has outstanding opportunities for solitude.” A story related in “Wilderness Management” (1990 Hendee, Stankey, & Lucas) about Mr. Whitney illustrates how this solitude can be impaired in popular areas.

“A man..., on August 4, 1949, climbed the peak with his father. Proudly, they signed the summit register, the sixth and seventh individuals to have done so that year. On August 11, 1972, this same man climbed Mount Whitney with his son. Upon signing the register

they noted with some shock that they were the 259th and 260th persons on record that day! Presumably there was less pride, and certainly less wilderness, in the experience.

The Summit of Mt. Baker has been noted to have up to 200 climbers in one day. How would this effect your experience if you were climbing the mountain? How are all the people affecting the area? Do you see this as a problem? If so, what could be done to manage the situation? What could you personally do to alleviate the problem?

Possible viewpoints: Management Agency (e.g. Forest Service, Park Service, BLM, Fish and Wildlife Service), Climbers, Backpackers, Climbing Guide.

### **Solitude/Demand Wilderness Manager**

Your group represents the wilderness managers. You need to decide on a plan to reduce the problems presented. Your job is to manage the wilderness according to what the Wilderness Act states. You have been given some key points in the act that you will need to consider in your plan.

In 15 minutes you will be given time to briefly present your recommendations to the class. You should include answers for the following questions:

1. How will you provide people with an opportunity for solitude and a wilderness experience?
2. What can be done to protect the plants and wildlife from damage due to human activity?
3. Where will people go to the bathroom and what will be done with the human waste?
4. What will be done about litter?

### **Solitude/Demand Climbing Guide**

Your group represents a mountain climbing guide service. You have been given a sheet with key points from the Wilderness Act you may use in your presentation. Your goal is to convince the wilderness managers that you should be given a permit to take your clients climbing on Mt. Baker. Remember that your true objective is to make money, but you also care about the land. Solitude is not as important to you as the challenge and risk of climbing the mountain. You need to come up with a plan to minimize the impacts of humans on the area and on other people. How will your group help alleviate the problems instead of contributing to them?

In 15 minutes you will be given time to briefly present your ideas to the class. Some of the questions you should answer are:

1. How can you minimize the effect of your groups on other wilderness users who are seeking solitude and quiet?
2. What can you do to prevent damage/disturbance to the plants and animals of the area?
3. Where will your clients go to the bathroom and what will happen to their human waste?
4. What will be done with your garbage and leftovers from meals?

### **Solitude/Demand Day Hikers**

Your group represents the day hikers. You like to escape city life for the day and get out into the peace and quiet of the wilderness. You have always been able to go hiking up Mt. Baker on any day you wish without having a plan in advance. You do not, however, enjoy hiking five miles just to be surrounded by people. You have also noticed more litter, trampled ground, and toilet paper in the past few years.

In 15 minutes you will be given time to briefly present your ideas to the class. Be prepared to answer the following questions:

1. How should the wilderness managers provide you with the opportunity to find the solitude you seek?
2. What should be done to protect the damage and disturbances to the plants and animals of the area?
3. Where can people go to the bathroom and what should be done with the human wastes?
4. How can litter in the area be reduced or prevented?

## **Wildlife / Recreation**

Hannegan Pass is a frequently used camping area in the Mt. Baker area. Unfortunately, the local black bears have discovered this. They are well known for their ability to sniff out hiker's food stores. Last year a panicked backpacker showed up at the Glacier Public Service Center. She had gone on a day hike and left her camp set up at the pass. She returned to find her tent wiggling through the meadow. A bear had smelled her snacks and crawled inside. Too frightened to stay, she hiked out without her car keys and hitch hiked to the nearest ranger station for help. What should be done about the bear? Is it a safety hazard? What about the Woman who left her food in the tent? Is it the responsibility of the wilderness managers to keep bears away or are the users responsible for hanging their food to keep the bears away? What if hanging food does not work and the bear still gets the food?

Possible viewpoints: Wilderness manager, Hikers, Wildlife advocacy group.

### **Wildlife/Recreation Wilderness Manager**

Your group represents the wilderness managers. Your goal is to manage the area in accordance with the Wilderness Act. You have been given a sheet with the key points from the Act that relate to this issue. Your job is to come up with ideas to resolve the situation.

In 15 minutes you will be given time to briefly present your ideas to the class. You should be able to answer the following questions:

1. Is the bear a safety hazard or is it part of the challenge and risk of a wilderness experience.
2. Is it the responsibility of the wilderness manager to keep the bear away or should the users deal with the problem by hanging food and camping where the bear is not hanging out?
3. What will you do to solve this issue?

### **Wildlife/Recreation Bear**

Your group is the bear. Your job is to let the wilderness manager know your position on this issue. You have lived on near Hannegan Pass all your life and you know the area well enough to survive the harsh climate in this rugged land. You don't see a problem. If hikers leave their food, of course you are going to eat it.

In 15 minutes you will be given time to convince the class that you should be allowed to stay. Use the key wilderness points from the Wilderness Act to support your case. You should be able to answer these questions:

1. Why should you be allowed to remain since you have become a “pest” and safety hazard to hikers?
2. What could be done to allow both you and the hikers to use the area in harmony?
3. How are the hikers adversely affecting your life?

### **Wildlife/Recreation Backpackers**

Your group represents the backpackers. You feel that the bear is a hazard to both your expensive equipment and your personal safety. What would you propose to the wilderness managers as a solution to the problem? Use points from the Wilderness Act to support your argument.

In 15 minutes you will be given time to briefly present your solution to the class. You should be able to answer the following questions:

1. What should be done about the conflicting interests of the bear and you?
2. Why should you be allowed to continue to use the area?
3. How could you and the bear exist in harmony?

## **Risk and Challenge vs Safety**

The definition of wilderness provides for “outstanding opportunities for ... a primitive and unconfined type of recreation”. By definition this involves a certain amount of challenge and risk. Unpredictable weather, tricky stream crossings, steep mountain climbing, and avalanches are a few of the possible hazards of wilderness travel. Although some of these conditions can't be controlled, measures can be taken to make the environment safer. For example, bridges can be placed over hazardous creeks to provide a safe crossing.

Views on what should be done in these situations vary widely. Some say there should be no maintained trails or structures in the wilderness while others would like to see all the bumps smoothed out so no one will trip.

On the Mt. Baker District a couple was out hiking and came to a creek crossing. The trail met the creek at a planned ford that was flat and very safe to cross, but was about thigh deep. Not wanting to get wet, the couple headed up stream to find a place to rock hop. They ended up attempting to cross above a 40' waterfall. After crossing, the man reached back to help the woman as she slipped on a boulder and fell to her death. What would you do about the crossing? Was her death part of the risk taken when going into a wilderness area? What about the wilderness users that want the challenge? Should we adapt the wilderness to the users or, should the users have to adapt to the wilderness?

Possible viewpoints: Wilderness manager, Senior hiking club, Family hikers, Adventure group.

## **Risk and Challenge/Safety Wilderness Manager**

Your group represents the wilderness managers. Your job is to manage the wilderness according to the Wilderness Act. You've been given a sheet with key points from the Act to consider in your decisions. You also need to consider factors such as public safety and liability.

In 15 minutes you will be given time to briefly present your ideas to the class. You should be able to answer the following questions:

1. How safe can we make the wilderness?
2. Should the wilderness be adapted to the users, or should the users adapt to the wilderness?
3. What would you do about the crossing?
4. Do the more advanced users have a right to trails that include some risk and challenge?

## **Risk and Challenge/Safety Wilderness Adventure Group**

Your group represents the wilderness adventure group members. You like challenge and risk involved in wilderness travel, Fast moving streams, cliffs, and freezing weather are all a part of the experience you seek. Of course, you are prepared for what you might face and have the experience to travel safely. You want to keep the “wild” in wilderness. Your challenge is to convince the wilderness managers to stop putting in signs and bridges on all the trails.

In 15 minutes you will be given time to briefly present your ideas to the class. Use points from the wilderness act sheet to support your arguments. You should be able to answer the following questions:

1. How safe can we make the wilderness?
2. Should the wilderness be adapted tot he users, or should the users adapt to the wilderness?
3. What would you do about the crossing?
4. Do the more advanced users have a right to trails that include some risk and challenge? What about the highly skilled users?

## **Risk and Challenge/Safety Senior Hiking Group**

You represent a hiking group for senior citizens. You are active and enjoy day hiking in the wilderness. Your not as agile as you used to be, however, and can't climb rocks or ford streams safely anymore. You feel that wilderness areas should be available for your use and that safe trails, bridges, and signing are appropriate in the mountains. Your job is to convince the wilderness managers to put in bridges and signs so people can safely travel in the wilderness.

In 15 minutes you will be given time to briefly present your ideas to the class. Use points from the wilderness act sheet to support your arguments. You should be able to answer the following questions:

1. How safe can we make the wilderness?
2. Should the wilderness be adapted tot he users, or should the users adapt to the wilderness?
3. What would you do about the crossing?
4. Do the more advanced users have a right to trails that include some risk and challenge? What about the less skilled users?